

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
APRIL 17, 2013**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

ABSENT: Guarino, Rodriguez

- Chairman's Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2013-101 | 207 Delaware |
| 2. Case No. 2013-106 | 1025 S. Frio |
| 3. Case No. 2013-095 | 720 E. Guenther |
| 4. Case No. 2012-235 | 122 Roy Smith (Formerly 219 Ave A) |
| 5. Case No. 2013-105 | 201 Arden Grove |
| 6. Case No. 2013-087 | 420 E. Cesar Chavez |
| 7. Case No. 2013-110 | 1221 Broadway |
| 8. Case No. 2013-109 | Design Guidelines for the Brooks Schools of Aerospace Medicine |
| 9. Case No. 2013-100 | 1931 W. Huisache |
| 10. Case No. 2012-169 | 723 Donaldson |
| 11. Case No. 2013-099 | 818 S. Flores |

Commissioner Carpenter pulled items 4, 10, and 11 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

4. HDRC NO. 2012-235

Applicant: John Beauchamp

Address: 122 Roy Smith (Formerly 219 Ave. A)

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Construct a new, 260-unit apartment complex adjacent to the River Walk. The complex will be 4-5 stories tall and include an integrated parking garage and interior courtyard. Materials will consist of stucco, brick, corrugated metal, and concrete.

The complex will be split into two buildings, both with frontage on Avenue A, with Roy Smith Street running between the two buildings. Roy Smith Street will terminate at the existing pedestrian bridge at the site to provide pedestrian access to and from the River Walk. The northern building features a multi-level parking garage that sits above grade, while single-level parking for the southern building sits largely below grade. The multi-level garage largely fronts along I-35, with some exposure on Avenue A.

FINDINGS

- a. This case was given conceptual approval by the HDRC on August 15, 2012, with the following stipulations:
 1. The applicant further develop the building facade at the pedestrian level in future design work to maintain a continuous active edge at all elevations;
 2. Any parking garage facades exposed to pedestrian view incorporate screening or landscape buffers and provide clearly-defined pedestrian access in accordance with UDC sec.35-672.b.5; and
 3. Special attention be given to the design of the River Walk access point in terms of materials, pedestrian amenities, and landscaping.
- b. The plans submitted for final approval are consistent with the conceptual design and the provisions of UDC sections 35-672 and 35-674.
- c. The applicant has addressed all stipulations in the final design by providing visual breaks along the building façade and developing an extensive landscaping and hardscaping plan for the overall site.

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on these findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Connor as submitted based on findings a through c.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Carpenter

THE MOTION CARRIED.

10. HDRC NO. 2012-169

Applicant: Angela Whitaker-Williams, Perkins + Will

Address: 723 Donaldson

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Modify the scope of work at Pony Field at Jefferson High School from what was previously approved by the HDRC. Upon further inspection of the existing historic gym and administrative/library buildings, serious structural concerns due to building shifting and moisture infiltration have been found. The applicant proposes to address these concerns by arresting slab movements, creating better pier support, and introducing crawlspace drainage under these buildings to prevent further damage to these historic buildings.
2. In an effort to offset the costs of these structural repairs, the applicant proposes to simplify the bleachers and construction around Pony Field that was previously approved by the HDRC on June 6, 2012. The proposed press box and masonry structure designed to screen the new, larger Pony Field bleachers from view from the west will be eliminated and the existing bleachers, which sit below the adjacent parking area to the west of the field will be replaced with new aluminum bleachers, seating between 600 and 800. The applicant proposes to continue the 4' tall wrought iron ornamental fence along the west side of Pony Field which was previously approved by the HDRC to surround this area.
3. Construct a new concession stand building at the existing baseball field on campus. The proposed concession stand building will be located directly on the west side of the newly configured baseball field and will be constructed of brick.

4. Construct a new chiller enclosure on the east side of an existing campus building, between the building and an existing parking area/access drive. The proposed enclosure will consist of 8' tall brick walls with a cap and metal gates for access on the north elevation.

FINDINGS:

- a. This application was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on March 26, 2013. At that meeting, the applicant presented photos and images showing the movement of the historic gym and administrative/library buildings, which is proposed to be addressed by adding additional piles to the foundation and ventilating the crawl space. The committee found that these measures are appropriate. The committee also noted that while the proposal to replace the existing bleachers at Pony Field in situ and eliminate the previously proposed masonry entry and press box are appropriate modifications to the original scope of work to offset the cost of the structural repairs, some landscaping along the proposed 4' wrought iron ornamental fence would help to soften the edge between the field and the adjacent parking area. The committee also noted that any limiting of the scope of work at Jefferson High School to help offset the cost of performing the structural repairs should not include simplifying the design or appearance of the previously approved building additions on the campus. A representative from the Jefferson High School area neighborhood was present at the meeting and noted that the proposed cisterns to be installed at the campus baseball and softball fields will be very important to assist with drainage and avoiding future moisture-related issues in the historic school buildings.
 - b. This application is part of a larger scope project to implement Jefferson High School's master plan, as approved by the HDRC on March 21, 2012. Since that hearing, two other applications for work on the campus related to the master plan, including demolition of an existing building, construction of two additions, construction of a new press box and bleacher seating at Pony Field, and fencing and lighting at the campus' athletic fields have been heard by the HDRC—one on June 6, 2012, and one on July 6, 2012. Both applications received approval with certain stipulations.
 - c. At the HDRC hearing on June 6, 2012, where the proposal to construct a new press box and seating at Pony Field were considered, staff recommended approval of the proposed press box with the stipulation that it be reduced in scale and made more transparent to maintain the existing open nature of the field.
 - d. Staff finds that the elimination of the proposed press box and the replacement of the existing bleachers at Pony Field, as currently proposed by the applicant, will help maintain the open nature of the field and will not interfere with views across the campus. This modification to the previously approved scope of work is in keeping with staff's original recommendation on this item and the HDRC's approval from June 6, 2012.
 - e. Staff finds that the proposed structural repairs to the historic gym building and library/administrative wing are appropriate and necessary to extend the life of these structures. When the structural work is to begin on these buildings, the applicant should seek administrative approval from the Office of Historic Preservation staff.
 - f. The proposed new concession stand is minimal in design and will not significantly alter views of the existing historic buildings on this campus since it will be located across a driveway from a new addition to an existing building.
 - g. The proposed new chiller enclosure is minimal in design and in keeping with other similar structures on the campus. Its location will not obscure significant historic detailing or primary views of the historic campus.
1. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on finding e.
 2. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings c and d.
 - 3 & 4. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings f and g.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Valenzuela and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve updated drawings showing ventilation on the west elevation of the chiller enclosure. Applicant must return to HDRC once plan is developed for portables and temporary coach parking area.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

11. HDRC NO. 2013-099

Applicant: Alejandra I. Villarreal, c/o Beth Keel

Address: 818 S. Flores

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a garden shelter at the San Antonio Housing Authority (SAHA).

FINDINGS:

a. This property is zoned as historic due to the presence of known archaeological features. The installation of the proposed shelter requires minimal ground disturbance, and has been sited to avoid damaging any known features consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 8.

b. The installation of the shelter, though modern in design, does not destroy historic materials, features or spatial relationships, consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 9.

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a & b.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve as submitted based on findings a and b.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

12. HDRC NO. 2013-102

Applicant: Office of Historic Preservation

Address: 811 Ogden

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance for the property at 811 Ogden.

FINDINGS:

a. The house at 811 Ogden is one of only a few historic homes that remains in the Tobin Hill area to the west of McCullough Ave. It was built in 1908. It first appears in the 1911 city directory and on the 1912 Sanborn map. The home has not been substantially altered from its original form, aside from the removal of the original wraparound porch. The structure is Folk Victorian in style with subtle Queen Anne and Classical Revival influences. Since its construction, the home has had several different owners and has been used as both a single family and multi-family residence. Currently, the building is vacant.

b. A site visit to the property was conducted by the Designation and Demolition Committee on February 27, 2013. At that time, the committee noted that the structure could potentially be salvaged and that the proposed replacement plans could be beneficial for the community. The committee did not recommend a finding of historic significance for the property, but noted concern over the proposed demolition in terms of future demolitions in the vicinity and the erosion of the historic integrity of this area.

c. Staff has met previously with representatives of San Antonio College regarding concern over encroachment into the Tobin Hill neighborhood to the east of Main Street. Erosion of historic fabric around the edges of local historic districts is a concern.

d. Staff has received comments from residents concerned about the potential demolition of this particular property and demolitions in general in the Tobin Hill area. Staff has also received comments from residents who are in favor of the demolition and the proposed replacement plans. Given this, staff determined that the item warranted a public hearing and due process rather than an administrative determination to ensure that residents were given an opportunity to comment. Historic designation is a community planning tool that enables residents to identify and protect that which is important to them and the HDRC should take the public testimony into consideration in making a decision.

e. Staff finds that the structure at 811 Ogden, despite being in a state of disrepair, still has a relatively high degree of historic integrity.

f. Staff also finds that the structure at 811 Ogden meets more than the three required criteria for landmark designation as per the UDC 35-607, referenced above.

g. An application has been submitted to the Office of Historic Preservation to demolish this structure as part of the Alamo Community College District's ECO CENTRO project. This property is intended to be the site of a community garden and B-cycle station. Materials from this structure are proposed to be salvaged to the extent possible.

h. Staff finds that retaining the house would not prevent the installation of the B-cycle station and/or a garden in the yard of the structure if ownership were retained by the Alamo Community College District.

The property at 811 Ogden is eligible for a finding of historic significance. Staff recommends approval.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Valenzuela and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant denial for a finding of Historic Significance for 811 Ogden.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Carpenter, Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC NO. 2013-082

Applicant: Wesley Shearrer

Address: 206 W. Hollywood

Applicant withdrew

14. HDRC NO. 2013-108

Applicant: Casey Lange

Address: 302 E. Huisache Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace 65 damaged original one-over one wood windows with double pane, one-over-one vinyl windows; and
2. Replace all damaged wood trim on windows with new wood. Both the trim and window would be painted "Osgood Green" to match existing.

FINDINGS:

- a. A site visit was conducted by staff on April 5, 2013. The wood windows in this structure were visibly deteriorated beyond repair.

- b. When conditions warrant full window replacement, the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance 6.B.iv require that replacement windows match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail.
- c. The selected vinyl replacement window product is compatible in terms of size, type, configuration, form and appearance.
- d. The selected vinyl replacement window product is not compatible in terms of materials. Wood replacement windows with a design similar to the original wood windows would be more appropriate.
- e. The repair and replacement of wood trim is consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations. If vinyl windows are approved by the HDRC, the maintenance of the historic wood trim elements will mitigate the visual impact of the proposed vinyl replacement windows.

Staff does not recommend approval based on finding d. Staff recommends a wood replacement window with a similar design to the original wood windows.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant denial of item 1. Item 2 approved administratively.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair